

# NAVIGATING THE VAST TRADITION OF ST. AUGUSTINE'S SERMONS: OLD INSTRUMENTS AND NEW APPROACHES\*

*Shari Boodts*

## Abstract

The study of St. Augustine's sermons has developed, over the last three decades, into a dynamic part of the field of patristics. Still, this category of Augustine's oeuvre presents a number of challenges that complicate significant progress for several promising avenues of research into Augustine's preaching. This article first offers a *status quaestionis* on Augustinian sermon studies since the year 2000. In a second part, the author addresses the issues scholars of Augustine's preaching face: (a) access to a reliable text, (b) the size, dispersal and uneven identification of the corpus, (c) the problem of authentic versus inauthentic, (d) the distance between patristic sermon studies and medieval sermon studies. Finally, the article reviews resources – both existing and still in development – that can help scholars harness the full potential of the rich corpus of sermons attributed to the Bishop of Hippo: (a) the updated critical text of the sermons in *Brepols' Library of Latin Texts*; (b) existing tools to make sense of the different versions of (pseudo-)Augustine's sermons such as Gryson's *Répertoire général des auteurs ecclésiastiques latins de l'Antiquité et du Haut Moyen Âge* and Machielsen's *Clavis Patristica Pseudepigraphorum Medii Aevi*; (c) a recently started project to create a digital network of medieval manuscripts that transmit patristic sermon collections (PASSIM).

## Keywords

Augustine, Sermons, Preaching, *Sermones ad populum*, Early Christian preaching, Medieval preaching, Patristics, Pseudo-epigraphic writings of the Church Fathers, Manuscript studies, Transmission studies, Reception studies, Digital Humanities, Philology, Network analysis, Caesarius of Arles, Textual criticism, Paul the Deacon, Alanus of Farfa, Maurists

\* This article was written in the context of the project 'Patristic Sermons in the Middle Ages. The Dissemination, Manipulation, and Interpretation of Late-Antique Sermons in the Medieval Latin West', which is funded by the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No ERC-2018-stg 802210. I sincerely thank Jérémie Delmulle, Nicolas De Maeyer, Anthony Dupont and Gert Partoens for their helpful comments and suggestions on an earlier draft.

In his 2012 monograph on the rise of Christianity and the role of the Church's wealth at the time when the Roman Empire fell apart, Peter Brown writes the following on patristic sermons:

"Regular preaching – week in and week out, community by community – was the air the Christian churches breathed. The formal works of Christian authors, which now fill so many shelves in our libraries, are mere islands that jut out here and there from the immense and largely hidden oceanic shelf of oral discourse created by the Christian sermon."<sup>1</sup>

Brown goes on to devote significant attention to sermons as sources for his study on the complex relationship between wealth and the message of Christianity and focuses particularly on the preaching of Augustine of Hippo, whom he calls 'a magical speaker'.<sup>2</sup> This is a glowing recommendation of the importance of sermons for our understanding of Early Christianity from one of the foremost scholars of Late Antiquity. However, it represents, to a certain extent, a change of heart on Brown's part. In the first edition of his Augustinian biography,<sup>3</sup> Augustine's sermons and his role as preacher were notable mainly by their absence. In 2000 a second edition of the biography was published.<sup>4</sup> The main distinguishing feature of this revised edition is a long epilogue, offering new evidence and new directions for research into Augustine's life and thought. In this epilogue, the then relatively recent discovery of the Dolbeau sermons<sup>5</sup> and the Divjak letters<sup>6</sup> takes central stage. Brown reconsiders some of his previous

<sup>1</sup> Peter BROWN (2012), *Through the Eye of a Needle. Wealth, the Fall of Rome, and the Making of Christianity in the West, 350-550 AD*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, p. 72.

<sup>2</sup> BROWN 2012, p. 339 (note 1).

<sup>3</sup> Peter BROWN (1967), *Augustine of Hippo: A Biography*, London: Faber & Faber.

<sup>4</sup> Peter BROWN (2000), *Augustine of Hippo: A Biography. Revised Edition with a New Epilogue*, Berkeley-Los Angeles: University of California Press.

<sup>5</sup> In 1990 François Dolbeau discovered 26 authentic Augustinian sermons in a fifteenth-century manuscript, Mainz, Stadtbibliothek, I 9, previously known only through a few fragments or in severely abbreviated form. The Dolbeau sermons were published in clusters in a series of articles, but are gathered together in François DOLBEAU (1996), *Vingt-six sermons au peuple d'Afrique* (Collection des Études Augustiniennes. Série Antiquité, 147), Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes. A new edition and French translation are being prepared for the *Bibliothèque Augustinienne*. See also Henry CHADWICK (1996), 'New Sermons of St. Augustine', *The Journal of Theological Studies*, 47/1, p. 69-91.

<sup>6</sup> In 1974, Johannes Divjak discovered 29 unpublished letters by and to Augustine. The manuscripts in which he made his discovery, Marseille, Bibl. Mun., 209, s. XV and Paris, BnF, Lat. 16861, s. XII were produced in Aix-en-Provence and

conclusions regarding the character of Augustine's episcopate in light of the evidence provided in these newly discovered texts<sup>7</sup> and lays the blame for his earlier flawed interpretation with the fact that he did not sufficiently take into consideration Augustine's corpus of sermons and letters.<sup>8</sup> However, he also pinpoints the problem that complicates the incorporation of precisely this type of evidence:

"Augustine's letters and sermons circulated vigorously in later centuries; they did so in various collections that were less easy to identify than were his formal works. When printed editions of the collected works of Augustine began to appear, in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, many of his sermons and letters were not included. The manuscripts in which they had been copied were not immediately available to the editors, and so they did not make their way into the new, authoritative tomes. Yet they were known to have existed. Their titles had been listed in the *Indiculum* of Possidius. Some were referred to by their titles in the catalogues of Carolingian libraries. Others were partly known, through fragments cited by Medieval authors."<sup>9</sup>

Brown was certainly not alone in his reappraisal of the usefulness of the sermons for research into the development of Augustine's thinking, the historical context of early Christianity, and the social and political developments in Roman North Africa. Over the past several decades, the study of Augustine's sermons flourished and became one of the most dynamic parts of patristic studies.

However, the complexities of the transmission of Augustine's sermons, to which Brown's succinct description in the quotation above does not begin to do justice, create obstacles for the advancement of the study of the sermons. The obstacles I refer to are mainly methodological in nature. Is scholarship on the content of Augustine's sermons based on a reliable text? Do pronouncements on 'the entire corpus of Augustine's sermons' truly incorporate all Augustinian sermons we know today? Is our scope not too narrow, meaning do we

Saint-Cyran de Longaret respectively. The letters were published in *Augustinus, Epistolae ex duobus codicibus nuper in lucem prolatae*, ed. Johannes DIVJAK (Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum, 88), Wien: Hoelder-Pichler-Tempsky, 1981.

<sup>7</sup> BROWN 2000, p. 445 (note 4) ("Put briefly: I have found the Augustine of the Dolbeau sermons and of the Divjak letters to be considerably less the authoritarian, stern figure that my reading of the evidence available to me in the 1960s had led me to suspect").

<sup>8</sup> BROWN 2000, p. 446 (note 4) ("On looking back, I think that I had given undue weight to the formidable clarity of Augustine's formal theological works, and that I had not paid sufficient attention at the time to his sermons and letters").

<sup>9</sup> BROWN 2000, p. 442 (note 4).

not focus too much on a set ‘canon’ of sermons? Is it fair that the massive pseudo-Augustinian corpus is treated mostly as an after-thought? Does modern research show an awareness of the Late-Antique and Medieval organization of the sermon corpus, or are we guided mainly by the work of the Early-Modern editors? Is it defensible that the study of Augustine’s sermons is firmly entrenched in the field of patristic sermon studies and has no connection to the field of Medieval sermon studies? It is clear that these issues are not unique to the study of Augustine’s sermons, just as it is equally evident that recent scholarship does show an awareness of these pitfalls. Less widely known, however, is the fact that several resources exist that make it possible, or easier, to avoid them. Many are connected with the digital turn in the Humanities, which provides plenty of opportunities to surmount such obstacles. In the following pages, I would like to reflect on the challenges presented by the vast tradition of Augustine’s sermons and on some of the possibilities that emerge if we succeed in facing these challenges.

The extant corpus of Augustine’s sermons numbers over 900 items, traditionally divided into three categories: *sermones*, *tractatus*, *enarrationes*. The final categories consist of, respectively, 134 tractates on the Gospel and First Letter of John and 205 sermons on the Psalms, while the first contains a heterogeneous body of some 580 sermons ‘to the people’. My focus will be in particular on these *sermones ad populum* and less on the *enarrationes in Psalmos* and *tractatus*, as the *sermones ad populum* exhibit the issues outlined above on a much larger scale than the other two categories of Augustine’s homiletic oeuvre.<sup>10</sup> I will furthermore present some of the resources and instruments – some have been around for a while, while others are only just starting to be developed – that can, if properly harnessed, facilitate existing scholarly interests and open up new areas of research into Augustine’s sermons.

## 1. A *status quaestionis* of Augustinian sermon studies, 2000-present

In order to look forward, we must first look back. I offer here a *status quaestionis* of the major publications in the field of Augustinian

<sup>10</sup> By which I do not mean to imply that the transmission of the *enarrationes* and the *tractatus* is straightforward. On the contrary, both categories, but especially the latter, were subject to intensive compilatory activity in the Middle Ages, and rewritten versions of the *tractatus* especially circulated widely in the Medieval homiliary tradition.

sermon studies since the year 2000, to give some indication of the recent directions research on the sermons has taken.<sup>11</sup>

The twenty-first century witnessed marked progress in the publication of modern critical editions of Augustine's *sermones ad populum*. The foundation for a systematic new edition was laid by Cyril Lambot in 1961 in the *Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina* with a volume containing ss. 1-50 (CCSL, 41). Since the turn of the century, ss. 51-70 (CCSL, 41Aa (2008): Luc De Coninck), ss. 151-156 (CCSL, 41Ba (2008): Gert Partoens), and ss. 157-183 (CCSL, 41Bb (2016): Shari Boodts) have appeared. The next volume in the series, containing ss. 71-94, edited by Luc De Coninck, is currently in print. The *Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum* published Augustine's *Enarrationes in Psalmos: en. Ps. 1-32* (CSEL, 93/1A (2003) and 1B (2011)), *en. Ps. 51-60* (CSEL, 94/1 (2004)), *en. Ps. 101-109* (CSEL, 95/1 (2011)), *en. Ps. 110-118* (CSEL, 95/2 (2015)), *en. Ps. 119-133* (CSEL, 95/3 (2001)), *en. Ps. 134-140* (CSEL, 95/4 (2002)), *en. Ps. 141-150* (CSEL, 95/5 (2005)). Several editions of rediscovered individual authentic sermons or parts of sermons appeared. I single out in particular the Erfurt sermons, the second major discovery of recent times.<sup>12</sup> Other editions were published by Brian Jensen and Clemens Weidmann<sup>13</sup> and, most recently, Jérémie Delmulle.<sup>14</sup> Hubertus Drobner also published numerous annotated texts and translations in the *Patrologia*

<sup>11</sup> A broader overview of the field can be found in Shari BOODTS, Anthony DUPONT (2018), 'Saint Augustine', in Anthony DUPONT, Shari BOODTS, Gert PARTOENS, Johan LEEmans, ed., *Preaching in the Patristic Era: Sermons, Preachers, and Audiences in the Latin West* (A New History of the Sermon, 6), Leiden-Boston: Brill, p. 177-197. Of course, for a general bibliography on Augustine and his oeuvre, the *Bulletin Augustinien*, published yearly in the second fascicle of the *Revue d'études augustiniennes et patristiques*, is indispensable. Furthermore, see also Hubertus R. DROBNER (2010), *Augustinus von Hippo, Sermones ad populum. Überlieferung und Bestand – Bibliographie – Indices: Supplement 2000-2010* (Patrologia, 25), Frankfurt: Peter Lang and Hubertus R. DROBNER (2000), *Augustinus von Hippo. Sermones ad populum – Überlieferung & Bestand, Bibliographie, Indices* (Supplements to *Vigiliae Christianae*, 49), Leiden-Boston: Brill. Finally, it is highly useful to research <https://www.augustinus.de/> with the keyword 'sermones' (consulted on 26 May 2019).

<sup>12</sup> Isabella SCHILLER, Dorothea WEBER, Clemens WEIDMANN (2008-2009), 'Sechs neue Augustinuspredigten. Teil 1/2', *Wiener Studien*, 121, p. 227-284 and 122, p. 171-213.

<sup>13</sup> Brian M. JENSEN, Clemens WEIDMANN (2017), 'Another Brick to the Augustinian Wall. New texts by Augustine discovered in the *Sanctorale* of the *Lectionarium Placentinum*', *Revue d'études augustiniennes et patristiques*, 63/2, p. 239-276.

<sup>14</sup> Jérémie DELMULLE (2018), 'Une page inédite d'Augustin sur le septième jour de la Création, tirée du s. 229 W', *Revue d'études augustiniennes et patristiques*, 64/2, p. 243-285.

series, though his focus was more on providing access rather than achieving a critically improved text.<sup>15</sup>

In the margins of the editorial work, several studies on the manuscript tradition of the sermons were published, most notably the work of Luc De Coninck<sup>16</sup> and Gert Partoens.<sup>17</sup> The Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften added several more volumes to its series on *Die handschriftliche Überlieferung der Werke des heiligen Augustinus* (Veröffentlichungen der Kommission zur Herausgabe des Corpus der Lateinischen Kirchenväter), making an essential contribution not only to the study of the sermons, but to the study of the entire oeuvre of Augustine. Clemens Weidmann has taken the lead when it comes to authenticity critique and the recovery of original Augustinian material in

<sup>15</sup> *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zum Buch Genesis (Sermones 1-5). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Kommentar (Patrologia, 7)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2000; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zur Kirch- und Bischofsweihe (Sermones 336-340/ A). Einleitung, revidierter Mauriner-Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 9)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2003; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zu den Büchern Exodus, Könige und Job (Sermones 6-12). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 10)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2003; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zum Weihnachtsfest (Sermones 184-196). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 11)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2003; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zum Buch der Sprüche und Jesus Sirach (Sermones 35-41). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 13)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2004; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zum österlichen Triduum (Sermones 218-229/D). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 16)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2006; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zum Markusevangelium (Sermones 94/A-97). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 19)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2007; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zu Neujahr und Epiphanie (Sermones 196/A-204/A). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 22)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2010; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zur Apostelgeschichte (Sermones 148-150). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 26)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2012; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zu den alttestamentlichen Propheten (Sermones 42-50). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 29)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2013; *Augustinus von Hippo, Predigten zu den Psalmen (Sermones 13-34). Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung und Anmerkungen (Patrologia, 35)*, Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2016.

<sup>16</sup> Luc DE CONINCK, Bertrand COPPIETERS 't WALLANT, Roland DEMEULENAERE (2006), *La tradition manuscrite du recueil De verbis Domini jusqu'au xiie siècle. Prolégomènes à une édition critique des Sermones ad populum d'Augustin d'Hippone sur les évangiles (serm. 51 sqq.)* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 45), Turnhout: Brepols.

<sup>17</sup> E.g. Gert PARTOENS (2010), 'A More Original Version of s. 142 of Saint Augustine', *Augustiniana*, 60/1, p. 119-144; Gert PARTOENS (2007), 'Une version augmentée de la collection médiévale de sermons augustiniens *De uerbis Domini et Apostoli* et son importance pour la transmission de l'oeuvre homilétique de l'évêque d'Hippone', *Recherches augustiniennes et patristiques*, 35, p. 189-237.

pseudo-epigraphic sermons.<sup>18</sup> Forays are also being made into the Medieval reception of the *sermones ad populum*, in particular in the magnificent Augustinian compilation of the Carolingian scholar Florus of Lyon.<sup>19</sup>

The greatest concentration of articles<sup>20</sup> on Augustine's sermons is found in *Ministerium Sermonis*, a subseries of Brepols' *Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia* which publishes the proceedings of a series of conferences on Augustine's and patristic sermons.<sup>21</sup> Dolbeau's discovery of the Mainz sermons also continues to spark philological and codicological research, as well as research on their content, context and reception.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>18</sup> *Augustinus. Sermones Selecti*, ed. Clemens WEIDMANN (Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum, 101), Berlin-Boston: De Gruyter, 2015; Clemens WEIDMANN (2012), 'Discovering Augustine's Words in Pseudo-Augustinian Sermons', in Anthony DUPONT, Gert PARTOENS, Mathijs LAMBERIGTS, ed., *Tractatio Scripturarum. Philological, exegetical, rhetorical and theological studies on Augustine's sermons* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 65), Turnhout: Brepols, p. 41-58.

<sup>19</sup> Shari BOODTS (2015), 'Florus of Lyon's *Expositio epistolarum beati Pauli apostoli* and the transmission of Augustine's *Sermones ad populum*', in Reinhart CEULEMANS, Pieter DE LEEMANS, ed., *On Good Authority. Tradition, Compilation and the Construction of Authority in Literature from Antiquity to the Renaissance* (LECTIO Studies on the Transmission of Texts and Ideas, 2), Turnhout: Brepols, p. 141-155; Shari BOODTS (2017), 'Les sermons d'Augustin dans la bibliothèque de Florus. Perspectives comparatistes avec la *Collectio ex dictis XII Patrum*', in Pierre CHAMBERT-PROTAT, Franz DOLVECK, Camille GERZAGUET, ed., *Les Douze Compilations Pauliniennes de Florus de Lyon. Un carrefour des traditions patristiques au IXe siècle* (Collection de l'École Française de Rome, 524), Rome: École Française de Rome, p. 197-211. See also Gert PARTOENS (2016), 'An ancient anthology of quotations from Augustine's homiletic works. Content, sources, transmission and partial critical edition', *Revue Bénédictine*, 126, p. 59-111.

<sup>20</sup> See also Isabelle BOCHET, ed. (2012), *Augustin philosophe et prédicateur. Hommage à Gouven Madec. Actes du colloque international organisé à Paris les 8 et 9 septembre 2011* (Collection des Études augustinianes. Série Antiquité, 195), Paris: Institut d'Études Augustinianes.

<sup>21</sup> Gert PARTOENS, Anthony DUPONT, Mathijs LAMBERIGTS, ed. (2009), *Ministerium sermonis. Philological, Historical and Theological Studies on Augustine's Sermones ad Populum* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 53), Turnhout: Brepols; Anthony DUPONT, Gert PARTOENS, Mathijs LAMBERIGTS, ed. (2012), *Tractatio Scripturarum. Philological, exegetical, rhetorical and theological studies on Augustine's sermons* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 65), Turnhout: Brepols; Gert PARTOENS, Anthony DUPONT, Shari BOODTS, ed. (2017), *Prædicatio Patrum. Studies on Preaching in Late Antique North Africa* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 75), Turnhout: Brepols.

<sup>22</sup> Gerhard MAY, Geesche HÖNSCHEID, ed. (2003), *Die Mainzer Augustinus-Predigten. Studien zu einem Jahrhunderfund* (Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für europäische Geschichte Mainz. Abteilung für abendländische Religionsgeschichte. Beihefte, 59), Mainz: von Zabern; see also François DOLBEAU (2005), *Augustin et la prédication en Afrique. Recherches sur divers sermons authentiques, apocryphes ou anonymes* (Collection des Études Augustinianes. Série Antiquité, 179), Paris: Institut d'Études Augustinianes.

Regarding the patristic context<sup>23</sup> of Augustine's sermons, their chronology continues to be debated. In 2000 Pierre-Marie Hombert published his *Nouvelles recherches de chronologie augustinienne* (Collection des Études Augustiniennes. Série Antiquité, 163), Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes. Hubertus Drobner has offered several contributions to this thorny issue.<sup>24</sup> To the sermons' rhetorical style, Lutz Mechlinsky offered a useful contribution.<sup>25</sup>

The past two decades have also seen several inquiries into the content of the sermons. Book-length studies of the sermons as sources for Augustine's ethics, the development of his theology and his engagement with the Donatist and Pelagian heresies were furnished by, among others, Andrea Bizzozero,<sup>26</sup> Joseph Clair,<sup>27</sup> Anthony Dupont,<sup>28</sup> Adam Ployd,<sup>29</sup> Paweł Sambor,<sup>30</sup> and Ivonne Tholen.<sup>31</sup>

Finally, while not specifically focused on Augustine's sermons, several volumes offered important contributions to the field, by giving

<sup>23</sup> See also Hildegund MÜLLER (2012), 'Preacher: Augustine and His Congregation', in Mark VESSEY, ed., *A Companion to Augustine* (Blackwell Companions to the Ancient World), Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, p. 297-309.

<sup>24</sup> Hubertus R. DROBNER (2000), 'The Chronology of St. Augustine's *Sermones ad populum*', *Augustinian Studies*, 31, p. 211-218; Hubertus R. DROBNER (2003), 'The Chronology of St. Augustine's *Sermones ad populum* II. Sermons 5 to 8', *Augustinian Studies*, 34, p. 49-66; Hubertus R. DROBNER (2004), 'The Chronology of St. Augustine's *Sermones ad populum* III. On Christmas Day', *Augustinian Studies*, 35, p. 43-53.

<sup>25</sup> Lutz MECHLINSKY (2004), *Der 'modus proferendi' in Augustins 'sermones ad populum'* (Studien zur Geschichte und Kultur des Altertums, Neue Folge, Reihe 1. Band 23), Paderborn-Munich-Vienna-Zurich: Ferdinand Schöningh. See also Gert PARTOENS (2014), 'Augustine on Predestination, Immortal Babies and Sinning Foes: A Rhetorical Analysis of Sermon 165', *Augustinian Studies*, 45/1, p. 29-48.

<sup>26</sup> Andrea BIZZOZERO (2010), *Il mistero pasquale di Gesù Cristo e l'esistenza credente nei Sermones di Agostino* (Patrologia, 23), Frankfurt: Peter Lang.

<sup>27</sup> Joseph CLAIR (2016), *Discerning the Good in the Letters and Sermons of Augustine*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

<sup>28</sup> Anthony DUPONT (2014), *Preacher of Grace. A Critical Reappraisal of Augustine's Doctrine of Grace in his Sermones ad populum on Liturgical Feasts and During the Donatist Controversy* (Studies in the History of Christian Traditions, 177), Leiden-Boston: Brill; Anthony DUPONT (2013), *Gratia in Augustine's Sermones ad Populum during the Pelagian Controversy. Do Different Contexts Furnish Different Insights?* (Brill's Series in Church History, 59), Leiden-Boston: Brill.

<sup>29</sup> Adam PLOYD (2015), *Augustine, the Trinity and the Church. A Reading of the Anti-Donatist Sermons*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

<sup>30</sup> Paweł SAMBOR (2017), *La participation sacramentelle: une entrée dans la dynamique de la vie divine d'après les Sermons au Peuple de saint Augustin* (Paradosis, 59), Münster: Aschendorff.

<sup>31</sup> Ivonne THOLEN (2010), *Die Donatisten in den Predigten Augustins. Kommunikationslinien des Bischofs von Hippo mit seinen Predighörern* (Arbeiten zur Historischen und Systematischen Theologie, 16), Berlin: Hopf.

relevant information for the further study of Augustine's homiletic oeuvre, e.g. the work of Michael Margoni-Kögler,<sup>32</sup> or by making ample use of his sermons as sources for their scholarly inquiry, e.g. the work of Paul Kolbet<sup>33</sup> and Joseph McInerney<sup>34</sup> or the volume edited by Margaret Atkins and Robert Dodaro.<sup>35</sup>

## 2. Challenges presented by the tradition of Augustine's sermons

As a body of work on Augustine's sermons, a category of his oeuvre that has long been overlooked or outright dismissed, the overview above – which focuses only on the 'biggest' studies and does not include a number of excellent journal articles and book chapters – is very impressive. However, though it may not be immediately apparent, the obstacles presented by the size of the corpus of Augustinian sermons and the complexity of their transmission do erect a barrier that prohibits, or at least slows down, certain promising research avenues. In the introduction I formulated these obstacles as provocative questions, but in fact they can be boiled down to four issues, issues that have a particular context and are intricately connected with the centuries-long tradition of text-critical research on the sermons: (a) access to a reliable text, (b) the size, dispersal and uneven identification of the corpus, (c) the problem of authentic versus inauthentic, (d) the distance between patristic sermon studies and Medieval sermon studies.

### a. Access to a reliable text

It is quite obvious that research is steered heavily by the availability of primary sources. The publication of a new modern edition gives a natural impetus to renewed interest in and consequently new interpretations of the published texts. For Augustine's sermons, a good

<sup>32</sup> Michael MARGONI-KÖGLER (2010), *Die Perikopen im Gottesdienst bei Augustinus. Ein Beitrag zur Erforschung der liturgischen Schriftlesung in der frühen Kirche* (Veröffentlichungen der Kommission zur Herausgabe des Corpus der lateinischen Kirchenväter, 29), Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften.

<sup>33</sup> Paul R. KOLBET (2002), *The cure of souls. St. Augustine's reception and transformation of classical psychagogy*, Philadelphia: University of Notre Dame Press.

<sup>34</sup> Joseph J. MCINERNEY (2016), *The Greatness of Humility: St. Augustine on Moral Excellence*, Eugene (Oregon): Pickwick.

<sup>35</sup> Margaret ATKINS, Robert J. DODARO, ed. (2001), *Augustine: Political Writings*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

example is the doctoral dissertation of Marie Pauliat (Lyon, 2017),<sup>36</sup> which offers an exegetical and rhetorical analysis of Augustine's sermons on the Gospel of Matthew, sermons which were edited in 2008 by Luc De Coninck and his collaborators (CCSL, 41Aa). On the other side of the spectrum, texts much deserving of scholarly attention can languish in manuscript form indefinitely because no one is interested in producing, or indeed qualified to produce, a critical edition. Until recently,<sup>37</sup> an example of this with a direct impact on the study of the reception of Augustine was the absence of an *editio princeps* of the Venerable Bede's Augustinian florilegium, the *Collectio ex opusculis sancti Augustini in epistulas Pauli apostoli*. Available only in an English translation<sup>38</sup> with an imperfect source apparatus, this rich compilation of over 450 fragments from the works of Augustine could not be exploited to study, e.g., Bede's library at Wearmouth-Jarrow, the presence of Augustine in Anglo-Saxon England, or the interpretation of Augustine's exegesis of the Pauline corpus in the Middle Ages.

In practice, it is unacceptably limiting to confine research to the texts that are available in modern scholarly editions, but on the other hand, it is prohibitively time-consuming to base research on texts as they appear in the manuscripts. Moreover, reliance on a text as it appears in a Medieval manuscript is often unscientific if done without any text-critical reflection. The same holds true in many cases for the use of pre-modern editions. In the case of Augustine's

<sup>36</sup> Marie PAULIAT, *Parole de Dieu, réponses des hommes. Augustin exégète et prédicateur du premier évangile dans les Sermones in Matthaeum* (unpubl. doct. diss.), Lyon, 2017. The dissertation will appear by the end of 2019 in the Collection des Études augustiniennes. Série Antiquité.

<sup>37</sup> The edition, which includes an extensive introduction on the context, nature, and sources of the collection, is currently well advanced, as a recently completed PhD project at the University of Leuven. Several publications have already demonstrated the possibilities of the florilegium. See e.g. Nicolas DE MAEYER (2018), 'I Tim.-Hebr. in the Venerable Bede's Augustinian Commentary on the Pauline Epistles: a Stemmatical Analysis of its Transmission', *Revue Bénédictine*, 128/2, p. 294-315; Nicolas DE MAEYER, Anthony DUPONT (2017), 'Patrum uestigia sequens. The transmission and reception of Augustine's exegesis of Eph. 3:17-18 in the Venerable Bede's *Collectio ex opusculis sancti Augustini in epistulas Pauli apostoli*', *Traditio: Studies in Ancient and Medieval History, Thought and Religion*, 72, p. 21-59; Jérémie DELMULLE (2016), 'Le florilège augustinien de Bède le Vénérable et les discussions tardoantiques sur la grâce, le libre arbitre et la prédestination', *Revue d'études augustiniennes et patristiques*, 62/2, p. 265-292.

<sup>38</sup> David HURST, transl. (1999), *Bede the Venerable. Excerpts from the Works of Saint Augustine on the Letters of the Blessed Apostle Paul*, Kalamazoo (Michigan): Cistercian Publications.

sermons, the most important pre-modern edition is that published by the Benedictines of St. Maur in 1683 and widely available, both digitally and in print, via Migne's *Patrologia Latina* (PL, 38-39). We know quite a bit about the Maurists' *modus operandi* and the manuscripts they used,<sup>39</sup> which is comforting. Where they had a complete view of the manuscript tradition, as a rule the Maurist editions hold up exceptionally well to modern standards of textual criticism, but when they have missed important branches of the tradition, the text needs numerous improvements. It is convenient to return to the well-known and familiar tomes of the *Patrologia Latina*, precisely because they are available in a digital format at a time when digitally searching large text corpora has become a staple of scholarly research. Nevertheless, it is vital to remain vigilant of the limitations and varying quality of the editions available online. The same holds true for the English translation of the sermons by Edmund Hill.<sup>40</sup> For those not competent in Latin, this translation is an invaluable resource to gain access to Augustine's homiletic corpus, but the scale and beauty of this series must not disguise the fact that Hill worked from the editions he had at his disposal, and the vast majority of them were not modern critical editions.

To give an impression of the impact modern editorial work can have on the text of the sermons, we need not look at sermons in which entire new sentences or paragraphs have been discovered in the manuscripts – they are, after all, the exception rather than the rule. Instead, let us take a 'regular' sermon. Augustine's sermon 180 is a sermon transmitted as part of several Ancient and Medieval collections. The Maurists knew only the secondary branch of the manuscript transmission. When we compare the Maurist text with the recent critical edition,<sup>41</sup> which did incorporate the entire transmission including the primary branch of the stemma, we find no less than 150 changes to the text. Though many of them are small changes, together they produce a text that is significantly different, and any research into this sermon's content must use the improved text, if the scholarly conclusions are to be on solid scientific footing.

<sup>39</sup> Cyril LAMBOT (1969), 'Les manuscrits des sermons de saint Augustin utilisés par les Mauristes', *Revue Bénédictine*, 79, p. 98-114.

<sup>40</sup> Edmund HILL, transl. (1990-1997), *The Works of Saint Augustine. A Translation for the 21st Century*, III/1-11, *Sermons*, New York: New City Press.

<sup>41</sup> Shari BOODTS (2013), 'Augustine's *sermo* 180 on Iac. 5, 12: *Ante omnia nolite iurare*. A new critical edition with introduction', *Recherches augustinianes et patristiques*, 37, p. 1-50, reprinted in *CCSL*, 41Bb, p. 657-684.

*b. The size, dispersal and uneven identification of the corpus of Augustine's sermons*

As the above *status quaestionis* demonstrates, modern scholarship agrees on the fact that the corpus of Augustine's sermons constitutes a valuable resource. Several scholarly inquiries take entire categories of Augustinian sermons – anti-Donatist sermons, Christmas sermons, anti-Pelagian sermons, sermons on the Gospels – as their subject. However, gaining access to the full extant corpus of Augustine's sermons and thus being sure about incorporating all possible relevant sermons, is not self-evident.<sup>42</sup> The extant corpus of Augustine's sermons numbers over 900 items, traditionally divided into three categories: *sermones*, *tractatus*, *enarrationes*. The final two categories were compiled into collections by Augustine himself which has given them greater stability over the course of their transmission, something which is not true of the ca. 580 extant *sermones ad populum*. Here, smaller collections were formed and set into circulation based on the transcriptions made by professional stenographers who recorded Augustine's *ex tempore* oral delivery.<sup>43</sup> The Late-Antique collections were split up, merged and otherwise reorganized during the Middle Ages, leading to the situation where a single sermon can be part of multiple collections. Today, we use the term 'collection' to denote an organized series with a rational classification.<sup>44</sup> These collections may have originated in Late Antiquity, but may equally be the product of Medieval compilatory activities.

In the Early-Modern period, the first editors of Augustine's sermons published a number of these collections as they found them in the manuscripts.<sup>45</sup> These editions in turn formed the basis for the

<sup>42</sup> I want to note that I am speaking here only of the difficulties in accessing all of Augustine's extant sermons. I am not referring to the lost part of Augustine's homiletic corpus, which, some argue, is so large that we cannot say anything of worth on Augustine's preaching, because there is so little preserved of what Augustine actually preached. I do not subscribe to that opinion. While it is important to be aware of what was lost, it would make no sense to disregard a corpus of over 900 sermons simply because there may once have been over 6000.

<sup>43</sup> Mark VESSEY (2013), 'Orators, Authors, and Compilers: The Earliest Latin Collections of Sermons on Scripture', in Max DIESENBERGER, Yitzhak HEN, Marianne POLLHEIMER, ed., *Sermo doctorum: compilers, preachers, and their audiences in the early medieval West*, Turnhout: Brepols, p. 25-44.

<sup>44</sup> François DOLBEAU (2012), 'Une collection méconnue de sermons sur les psaumes', in Anthony DUPONT, Gert PARTOENS, Mathijs LAMBERIGTS, ed., *Tractatio Scripturarum. Philological, exegetical, rhetorical, and theological studies on Augustine's sermons* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 65), Turnhout: Brepols, p. 9-39.

<sup>45</sup> One of the earliest editions of a series of Augustinian sermons was the publication at Cologne around 1470 (GDW 2913) of the *Quinquaginta homiliae*, a collection

Maurists' organization of the sermons. Their 1683 edition divides the *sermones ad populum* into five categories: (1) *sermones de scripturis*: 1-183, (2) *sermones de tempore*: 184-272, (3) *sermones de sanctis*: 273-340, (4) *sermones de diuersis*: 341-363, (5) *sermones dubii*: 364-394. To this was added a series of authentic homiletic fragments as well as an appendix containing what they considered to be inauthentic items wrongly attributed to Augustine. The Maurist numbering is still retained today and upheld both in the *Patrologia Latina* and in the new critical editions published in the *Corpus Christianorum* and the *Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum*. However, since 1683, numerous Augustinian sermons have been rediscovered, and research on several sermons has revealed them to be erroneously placed among the *sermones ad populum*.

New finds are inserted in the Maurist sequence in their proper place by adding a letter to the Maurist number. For example, *sermo* 159A is one of the sermons François Dolbeau discovered in the Mainz collection (cf. note 5). Because it is an exegetical sermon on Romans, it is inserted in the Maurists' series on the New Testament Letters, *sermones* 151-183. This type of insertion is not a rare occurrence.<sup>46</sup> Germain Morin, in his 1930 reflection on the editorial work done on the sermons since the publication of the Maurist edition, considers 138 sermons discovered since 1683 to be authentically Augustinian.<sup>47</sup> Less frequently, a sermon is taken out of its original place in the *sermones ad populum* to be inserted in a different spot. An example is *sermo* 164A. Verbraken<sup>48</sup> placed it among the sermons on Galatians due to the reference to Gal. 6, 9-10 in the sermon. However, there is no clear

put together by Caesarius of Arles in the sixth century and quite popular in the Middle Ages given the number of extant manuscripts. In 1494 Johannes Amerbach and Augustinus Dodo published five collections which were well-represented in the manuscripts (GWD 2920): the inauthentic *Sermones ad fratres in eremo*, the Medieval collection *De uerbis Domini et Apostoli*, the *In Epistolam Ioannis ad Parthos tractatus decem* and, again, the *Quinquaginta homiliae*. Two further sections of Amerbach's edition appeared in 1495 and contained sermons of diverse origin: 256 sermons *De tempore* and 51 *De sanctis*, both presented in the order of the liturgical calendar (cf. Gert PARTOENS, Shari BOODTS, Alicia EELEN (2013), 'Sermones ad populum', in Karla POLLmann, Willemien OTTEN, ed., *The Oxford Guide to the Historical Reception of Augustine*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, I, p. 323-330, which also contains further bibliography).

<sup>46</sup> See Pierre-Patrick VERBRAKEN (1976), *Études critiques sur les sermons authentiques de Saint Augustin* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 12), Steenbrugge: In Abbatia S. Petri, p. 12-42. A useful overview of the insertions can be found in DROBNER 2000 (note 11).

<sup>47</sup> Germain MORIN, ed. (1930), *Sancti Augustini sermones post Maurinos reperti* (Miscellanea Agostiniana, 1), Civitas Vaticana: Typis polyglottis Vaticanis.

<sup>48</sup> VERBRAKEN 1976 (note 46), p. 172.

evidence, either in the abridged version of the sermon (*s. Lambot* 28) nor in the complete text (*s. Erfurt* 4), that Gal. was the liturgical reading on the day the sermon was pronounced, or that the Bible passage is central to Augustine's argument in the sermon. Therefore, it is now considered to belong among the group of sermons on almsgiving, together with *ss. Erfurt* 2 and 3, where it now figures as *s. 350F* (part of the Maurists' *sermones de diuersis*).<sup>49</sup>

This organic, ever-changing system presents a problem, in the sense that it can be difficult for these changes to gain traction in the wider research community and, therefore, for the updated or newly inserted sermons to be incorporated in research. There are reference works (cf. *infra*), but they can be a little or a lot out of date. The danger is that we focus too narrowly on the most complete set of sermons that is collected in one place rather than seeking out the dispersed additions to the corpus.

### *c. Authentic versus inauthentic Augustinian sermons*

When Germain Morin published his review of the *sermones Augustini post Maurinos reperti* and ended up with 138 newly discovered authentic Augustinian sermons, he disavowed a large number of texts believed to be authentically Augustinian by previous generations. The temptation to attribute sermons to Augustine affected the entire Middle Ages and continued unabated in the Early-Modern period. The Maurists classified 317 sermons as apocryphal in their edition, now available as part of *Patrologia Latina* volume 39. They also counted 31 *sermones dubii*, which may or may not have been authentic, in their opinion. In Machielsen's priceless reference work, the *Clavis Patristica Pseudepigraphorum Medii Aevi*,<sup>50</sup> sermons wrongly attributed to Augustine are covered under item numbers 450 to 3387. What do we do with this massive pseudo-Augustinian homiletic corpus?

As heirs to the legacy of modern devotion to the concepts of originality and authorial intention, for a long time we have been naturally predisposed to dismiss anything reeking of inauthenticity. This dismissal was done to such effect that we do not even have an accurate idea of the size, nature and impact of this massive pseudo-Augustinian homiletic corpus. It doubtlessly contains material that is (near-)contemporary to

<sup>49</sup> SCHILLER, WEBER, WEIDMANN 2008-2009 (note 12).

<sup>50</sup> Johannes MACHIelsen (1990), *Clavis Patristica Pseudepigraphorum Medii Aevi. 1: Opera homiletica. Pars A (Praefatio) (Ambrosius-Augustinus)* (Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina), Turnhout: Brepols.

Augustine and was created in his own North-African context. At the same time, we find numerous Medieval creations loosely (or not so loosely) based on authentic Augustinian sermons. Determining whether a text is authentic or not can be very difficult; there are few hard-and-fast rules.<sup>51</sup> The current classification of a sermon as authentic or inauthentic often goes back to claims made by the great scholars and editors of the nineteenth and twentieth century, like Germain Morin, who seemed to rely on the intuition born of decades of experience to ascribe a text to one of the two categories. There is a certain arbitrariness to it, and an expansive grey area. An example of the latter are the sermons by Caesarius of Arles (ca. 470-542). He compiled Augustine's sermons into collections, rewriting them and interspersing them with his own creations, in an effort to provide model sermons for the clergy in Gaul.<sup>52</sup> Of some of the Augustinian sermons he redacted, we also have independent parallel transmissions, in collections that were untouched by Caesarius. These parallel traditions show the extent to which Caesarius has interfered in his source material. The situation has led to an awkward construction. In the collection known as the *Quinquaginta homiliae* for example, half of the 50 sermons are counted in modern scholarship to belong among Augustine's authentic sermons – because Caesarius' interference was relatively limited – while the other half of the 50 sermons are edited among Caesarius' sermons. This construction completely does away with the original manuscript context, in which all the sermons of the *Quinquaginta Homiliae* traveled together and were read and used as a single body of texts. François Dolbeau has contributed much to the correct methodological approach to the problem of authenticity critique, urging modern scholarship to adopt the Maurists' habit of leaving room for doubt. In between 'authentic' and 'inauthentic', he believes the *sermones dubii* as a category should continue to be used and updated,

“[...] car beaucoup de sermons, notamment ceux qui nous sont parvenus grâce à des homéliaires [...] ont subi des dégradations durant

<sup>51</sup> WEIDMANN 2012 (note 18); Cyril LAMBOT (1969), 'Critique interne et sermons de saint Augustin', *Revue Bénédictine*, 79, p. 134-147; François DOLBEAU (1993), 'Nouveaux sermons de saint Augustin pour la conversion des païens et des donatistes (V)', *Revue des Études Augustiniennes*, 39/1, p. 57-108, in particular the 'Annexe': 'Prédication augustinienne et critique d'authenticité' at p. 107-108.

<sup>52</sup> Nicolas DE MAEYER, Gert PARTOENS (2018), 'Preaching in Sixth-Century Arles. The Sermons of Bishop Caesarius', in Anthony DUPONT, Shari BOODTS, Gert PARTOENS, Johan LEEMANS, ed., *Preaching in the Patristic Era: Sermons, Preachers, and Audiences in the Latin West* (A New History of the Sermon, 6), Leiden-Boston: Brill, p. 198-231; William E. KLINGSIRN (1994), *Caesarius of Arles: The Making of a Christian Community in Late Antique Gaul*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

leur transmission : abrègements, interpolations, adaptations des citations bibliques, substitutions lexicales, etc., de telle sorte que la frontière est souvent difficile à tracer entre les pièces authentiques et celles que l'on a modifiées pour répondre aux besoins des générations suivantes, en raison d'évolutions liturgiques ou linguistiques. D'autre part, en matière de critique d'authenticité, il ne suffit pas de relever les arguments favorables (*pars construens*), il faut aussi évaluer le poids des indices qui vont dans le sens opposé (*pars destruens*).<sup>53</sup>

The corpus of pseudo-Augustinian sermons is experiencing something of a revival.<sup>54</sup> Recently, Clemens Weidmann has drawn attention to pseudo-Augustinian sermons as a place to rediscover authentic Augustinian paragraphs, phrases, words.<sup>55</sup> A conference, organized in May 2019 by Matthieu Pignot, on 'Les sermons anonymes latins dans l'Antiquité tardive et le haut Moyen Âge (300-800): transmission, classification, datation' places sermons wrongly attributed to the great patristic preachers squarely on the agenda. These are important steps toward harnessing these sermons' untapped potential as a rich source of how the Middle Ages perceived and shaped Augustine's identity.

#### *d. The Medieval afterlife of Augustine's sermons*

The oftentimes artificial division between authentic and inauthentic harks back to the final challenge I want to address in this article: the fact that Augustine's sermons, like Latin patristic sermons in general, are studied first and foremost as patristic fossils, snapshots of Roman Late Antiquity. Perhaps one of the greatest results of the discovery of the Dolbeau sermons, is that it rubs our noses in the inadequacy of this attitude to the sermons. While it is true that the sermons bring us closer to the day-to-day Augustine, hammering at the Christian religion plank by plank and nail by nail, it would be a grave misjudgment to treat the vast majority of Augustine's sermons as if they were audio-recordings. Patristic sermons as we know them today are not fossilized remains of Late Antiquity, they are Medieval creatures with

<sup>53</sup> François DOLBEAU (2016), 'Compte rendu de *Augustinus, Sermones selecti*. Ediert von Clemens Weidmann, Berlin-Boston, De Gruyter, 2015 (Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum, 101)', *Revue d'études augustinianes et patristiques*, 62/2 (*Bulletin Augustinien pour 2015/2016 et compléments d'années antérieures*), p. 448-451, esp. p. 448.

<sup>54</sup> Robert S. STURGES (2013), 'Pseudo-Augustinian writings', in Karla POLLmann, Willemien OTTEN, ed., *The Oxford Guide to the Historical Reception of Augustine*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, III, p. 1612-1617.

<sup>55</sup> WEIDMANN 2012 (note 18).

a distant early-Christian ancestor. They have a Late-Antique core, but they have undergone Medieval manipulations, from inadvertent copying errors to deliberate abbreviations, from cut-and-paste jobs to complete rewritings so they would fit into altering contexts.<sup>56</sup>

Both in Late Antiquity and during the Middle Ages the vast majority of patristic sermons circulated in the form of sermon collections, containing anywhere from 20 to well over 200 sermons.<sup>57</sup> This was not a static tradition. The Late-Antique collections were generally single-author compilations. Throughout the Middle Ages, these Late-Antique sermon collections were continuously split up, combined, reorganized and mined to form new collections. Gradually, collections emerged that combined patristic and original Medieval sermons.<sup>58</sup> Thousands of manuscripts from the Medieval period transmit collections of patristic sermons. It is rare for two manuscripts to contain completely, entirely identical patristic sermon collections without changes, large or small, to the collections' content, structure, or para-texts (author attributions, titles, capitula etc.). These collections form a web that leads back, from copy to model, all the way to Late Antiquity. In this continual rearrangement and reinterpretation of the patristic heritage, the process of Medieval cultural formation reveals itself.<sup>59</sup>

Modern scholarship mainly identifies three functions for patristic sermon collections in Medieval contexts. (1) They were a traditional part of the Divine Office, especially the Night Office, as endorsed by

<sup>56</sup> See François DOLBEAU (2017), ‘Longueur et transmission des sermons d’Augustin au peuple: un examen des sermons pour l’Épiphanie et *De sanctis*’, *Revue Bénédictine*, 127, p. 5-27; François DOLBEAU (2016), ‘La prédication d’Augustin pour l’Ascension: quelques problèmes philologiques’, in Gaëlle HERBERT DE LA PORT-BARRÉ-VIARD, Annick STOEHR-MONJOU, ed., *Studium in libris. Mélanges en l’honneur de Jean-Louis Charlet* (Collection des Études Augustiniennes. Série Antiquité, 201), Paris: Institut d’Études Augustiniennes, p. 225-244. See also the article by Clemens Weidmann on Augustine’s *sermo 2* in this volume, which offers examples of these practices.

<sup>57</sup> François DOLBEAU (2005), ‘À propos d’un *agraphon*: réflexions sur la transmission de l’homilétique latine antique, avec édition du sermon ‘sermo sacerdotis dei’’, in François DOLBEAU, *Augustin et la prédication en Afrique. Recherches sur divers sermons authentiques, apocryphes ou anonymes* (Collection des Études Augustiniennes. Série Antiquité, 179), Paris: Institut d’Études Augustiniennes, p. 458-472.

<sup>58</sup> Henri BARRÉ (1962), *Les homéliaires carolingiens de l’École d’Auxerre* (Studi e testi, 225), Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana; Michael MARTIN (2010), ‘The Italian Homiliary: An example *pro omnibus bonis operibus* produced according to the ‘new’ Carolingian homiletic genre and reform measures’, *Sacris Erudiri*, 49, p. 261-338.

<sup>59</sup> Max DIESENBERGER, Yitzhak HEN, Marianne POLLHEIMER, ed. (2013), *Sermo doctorum: compilers, preachers, and their audiences in the early medieval West*, Turnhout: Brepols.

Charlemagne via the patristic homiliary he commissioned from Paul the Deacon.<sup>60</sup> (2) The Church Fathers were also considered good alternatives for original preaching.<sup>61</sup> (3) Finally, patristic sermons had a function in the context of monastic private reading for edification or meditation, as instructed in the Rule of St. Benedict (9, 8).<sup>62</sup> These functions have been identified primarily based on second-hand accounts (like Charlemagne's directives or Benedict's Rule) rather than the primary texts, the sermons themselves. Many collections found in the manuscripts are difficult to fit into any of these categories and it seems likely that patristic sermon collections found uses in a variety of intellectual, theological, exegetical, and polemical contexts.

Tapping into this Medieval afterlife of the sermons is difficult, because it requires an awareness of the vast manuscript tradition of the sermons. A thorough study of the manuscripts needs a particular type of specialized knowledge and access to the necessary heuristic instruments. Another barrier is a disciplinary one: the gap between patristic sermons studies and Medieval sermons studies.<sup>63</sup> Scholars of patristic preaching on the one hand tend to ignore the Medieval *Sitz im Leben* of the sermons of the Church Fathers. Their interest lies with the Late-Antique context. On the other hand, patristic sermons in the Middle Ages are understandably not a priority for Medieval sermon studies<sup>64</sup>

<sup>60</sup> Réginald GRÉGOIRE (1980), *Homéliaires liturgiques médiévaux. Analyse de manuscrits* (Biblioteca degli 'Studi medievali', 12), Spoleto: Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo; Aimé G. MARTIMORT (1992), *Les lectures liturgiques et leurs livres* (Typologie des sources du Moyen Âge occidental, 64), Turnhout: Brepols.

<sup>61</sup> BARRÉ 1962 (note 58); Edoardo BONA (1992), 'Un testimone disconosciuto del *Sermo I* di Cesario di Arles: il codice Parisinus Lat. 12116', *Civiltà classica e Cristiana*, 13, p. 153-168.

<sup>62</sup> MARTIMORT 1992 (note 60).

<sup>63</sup> Rare examples of scholarly publications that combine articles on patristic and Medieval preachers are DIESENBERGER et al. 2013 (note 59); Nicole BÉRIOU, Franco MORENZONI, ed. (2008), *Prédication et liturgie au Moyen Âge* (Bibliothèque d'Histoire culturelle du Moyen Âge, 5), Turnhout: Brepols; Georgiana DONAVIN, Cary J. NEDERMAN, Richard UTZ, ed. (2004), *Speculum Sermonis: Interdisciplinary Reflections on the Medieval Sermon* (Disputatio, 1), Turnhout: Brepols.

<sup>64</sup> For a state of the art of the field of Medieval sermon studies, see Beverly M. KIENZLE, ed. (2000), *The Sermon* (Typologie des Sources du Moyen Âge Occidental, 81-83), Turnhout: Brepols and Anne T. THAYER (2014), 'Medieval Sermon Studies since *The Sermon*: A Deepening and Broadening Field', *Medieval Sermon Studies*, 58, p. 10-27. A current focus in Medieval sermon studies is the oral, ritual, performance context of Medieval preaching, an area that has little use for patristic sermons in the Middle Ages. See also Nicole BÉRIOU (2018), *Religion et communication. Un autre regard sur la prédication au Moyen Âge*, Genève: Droz; Carolyn MUESSIG, ed. (2002), *Preacher, sermon and audience in the Middle Ages*, Leiden-Boston: Brill; Jacqueline HAMESSE, Xavier HERMAND, ed. (1993), *De l'homélie au*

when large parts of the corpus of original Medieval preaching still await exploration. However, we cannot truly tackle the study of the mutual influence of patristic and original Medieval preaching without first getting a firm grasp on the presence of patristic sermons in the Middle Ages.

### 3. Old and new resources for the study of Augustine's sermons

It is rather easy to enumerate problems, warn of dangers, and issue challenges. The hard part is solving these problems and offering tools to aid scholars who want to confront the dangers and tackle the challenges. I believe that to continue and expand the excellent scholarly work being done on Augustine's sermons, scholars would benefit especially from three things: (a) centralized access to the most recent critical texts of Augustine's sermons, (b) an easily updateable list of all known Augustinian and pseudo-Augustinian sermons, along with a clear overview of the different versions that exist of each sermon and of the interdependencies between authentic and inauthentic sermons, (c) a dynamic network of the manuscripts that transmit Augustine's sermons, replete with data on the manuscripts' date, origin, provenance, and genealogical relations with other manuscripts. While the full realization of all of these aims is, at best, part of a distant future, there are several resources that help us get the closest we can to them right now, or that will bring us closer as they continue to develop in the next few years.

#### a. *The Latin text of Augustine's sermons: Brepols' Library of Latin Texts*

The *status quaestionis* at the beginning of this article makes note of the most prominent series in which recent critical editions of Augustine's sermons have appeared. However, this short list is far from exhaustive. New critical editions of (parts of) Augustine's sermons are published regularly in journal articles or book chapters. Though we may assume that many of these isolated editions will eventually end up in their correct spot in the *Corpus Christianorum* editions of the *sermones ad populum*, it will probably be a very long time before all

*sermon. Histoire de la prédication médiévale. Actes du Colloque international de Louvain-la-Neuve (9-11 juillet 1992)*, Louvain-la-Neuve: Publications de l'Institut d'Études Médiévales.

the volumes in this series are published. In the meantime, it is imperative that scholars can easily track the most recent edition of the sermon they are interested in. In print, the systematic lists offered by Roger Gryson<sup>65</sup> and Hubertus Drobner<sup>66</sup> offer the most recent state of the field, up to the year 2007 and 2010 respectively.<sup>67</sup> The clear disadvantage of printed lists is that they will only be updated when a new volume appears, something which happens at the most every few years. Nevertheless, the lists are very thorough, scouting out editions of individual sermons in journals, conference proceedings, and *Festschriften*.

Since 2018, the most recent editions of Augustine's *sermones ad populum* can also be found in Brepols' database for Latin texts, the *Library of Latin Texts* or *LLT* (the previous CLCLT / CETEDOC).<sup>68</sup> The Table of Contents lists each of the Maurists' 396 authentic sermons and all the modern inserts individually. When you click on a sermon in the list, the identifier of the sermon offers the title of the series or journal that contains the sermon's most recent edition, in

<sup>65</sup> Roger GRYSON, Bonifatius FISCHER, Hermann J. FREDE (2007), *Répertoire général des auteurs ecclésiastiques latins de l'Antiquité et du Haut Moyen Âge. Tome I. Introduction. Répertoire des auteurs: A-H* (Vetus Latina. Die Reste der altlateinischen Bibel, 1/1<sup>5</sup>), Freiburg im Breisgau: Herder. Roger Gryson's repertorium is also accessible digitally, as part of Brepols' Vetus Latina Database: <http://apps.brepolis.net/vld/Default.aspx> (consulted on 30 May 2019, I would like to thank Brepols for granting me temporary access to the database in order to review its functionalities). This database offers digitized archival cards from the collection of Joseph Denk, who in the early twentieth century undertook to start collecting all citations of the Old Latin Bible from the writings of the Church Fathers. The references on these cards use the system of abbreviation also applied in the Frede/Gryson list of sigla. Therefore, in order to allow the user to understand the abbreviations, Gryson's list is offered as an index. This index has an advantage over the printed list: Roger Gryson updated it in 2013, including new editions published between 2007 and 2013. The list has limited searchability: the user must select an author first, then a work or category of works, in order to get, one at a time, the full descriptions offered with each work or category of works. It is not possible to search for cross-references, compare items, or search the full text of Gryson's catalogue. If your institution offers access to the database, it is a convenient supplement to the printed volume, but it does not offer a digital replacement with many added functionalities.

<sup>66</sup> DROBNER 2000 and 2010 (note 11).

<sup>67</sup> Additionally, the *Augustinus-Lexikon* keeps a record of new discoveries and new editions of reference in the index and as an addendum to each fascicule as it appears. The *Augustinus-Lexikon* is published by the Zentrum für Augustinus-Forschung at Würzburg. Volumes 1-3 appeared between 1986 and 2010, covering lemmata from Aaron to Mensura. The fourth volume is currently up to fascicule 5/6 (Prouerbium, Prouerbia (Prv) and promises to include the first lemmata with 's', bringing us closer to the entry on the sermons.

<sup>68</sup> <https://about.brepolis.net/library-of-latin-texts/> (consulted on 23 April 2019).

abbreviated form. The abbreviations are spelled out in a pdf-file that can be accessed after clicking on any line of text of a sermon. This pdf-file contains a detailed justification (in French and English) of the steps the editors of the *LLT* have followed in order to update Augustine's sermon corpus in the database. If Brepols commits to updating this digital platform regularly,<sup>69</sup> it provides a flexible, easily searchable<sup>70</sup> instrument to recover the latest editions of Augustine's sermons.

Of course, having the reference to the latest edition is a big help, but even better is the fact that Brepols' *Library of Latin Texts* also displays the text of the sermons as it occurs in its most recent edition. This is incredibly useful for any research that is based on a digital search through the corpus of Augustine's sermons, or a comparison of the text of several sermons. It will improve the accuracy of research into Augustine's biblical text, the chronology of the sermons, Augustine's rhetorical style (often modern editions rightfully reinstate rare or difficult words that Medieval scribes 'flattened' into more common expressions), intertextual references between the sermons and Augustine's other works, and last but not least, authenticity critique. Brepols' similarity search function, which allows the user to incorporate e.g. all morphological variants of the form entered in the particular search string or include results in which the search string is interspersed with one or more words, significantly heightens the accuracy of search results.

The update of the *LLT* is not limited to the new editions that appeared in the *Corpus Christianorum*. The editors of the database also included editions which were published in less obvious places.<sup>71</sup>

<sup>69</sup> That such a regular update is necessary is clear from the fact that the database is already – just slightly – out of date. In 2018, a new edition of *sermo* 82 appeared in Gert PARDOENS (2018), 'Augustine on Private *Correptio*. Content, Date, Manuscript Transmission and Critical Edition of *Sermo* 82', *Recherches augustiniennes et patristiques*, 38, p. 39–95. However, this sermon will be included in the upcoming *CCSL*, 41Ab (*sermones* 71–94), which will no doubt be an occasion for Brepols to update the sermon corpus in the *LLT* again.

<sup>70</sup> Relatively easily, at any rate. The pdf-file is quite bulky and unstructured and finding it requires some digging through the table of contents, but I believe the added value of this instrument still far outweighs any difficulties first-time users might experience.

<sup>71</sup> This is incredibly valuable and especially necessary for new or updated editions of sermons that have already previously appeared in the *CCSL* series. A telling example is found in the pages of this journal issue. Clemens Weidmann offers a new edition of Augustine's *sermo* 2. The sermon was last edited by Cyril Lambot in his 1961 edition of *ss. 1–50* (*CCSL*, 41). If not for an electronic corpus of references and full texts, this new 2019 edition runs the risk of disappearing into the cracks as scholars continue to turn to the *CCSL*-volumes for their texts.

To give just two examples, in 2010 Gert Partoens<sup>72</sup> presented an augmented version of *s. 142*, a sermon originally edited by André Wilmart,<sup>73</sup> reedited by Germain Morin,<sup>74</sup> and furnished with its *post sermonem* by François Dolbeau.<sup>75</sup> The *LLT* presents this complicated situation very clearly, describing the sermon as “*sermo 142 auctus* (= Wilmart 11 + Dolbeau 7 [Moguntinus 15])” with Partoens identified as the editor of paragraphs 6-10. For each paragraph, the edition on which it is based, is specified, which gives the user a clear idea of whether the text he or she is consulting, is a modern critical edition or the Maurist text via the *Patrologia Latina*. Something similar happens with *s. 295*. In a *Festschrift* dedicated to Paul Mattei, Gert Partoens and Clemens Weidmann<sup>76</sup> offer a number of emendations to the sixth paragraph of *s. 295*, without, however, providing a full new edition of the sermon. The *LLT* identifies the edition of the sermon on which the text in the database is based as *Patrologia Latina* 38, but identifies the sentences added by Partoens and Weidmann as *IPM* 74. Again, the user can clearly see on which edition every sentence of the sermon as it appears in the database is based.

It must be noted that Brepols’ updated *Library of Latin Texts* has some limitations and imperfections. The first is that the 317 pseudo-Augustinian sermons printed in the “appendix” of *Patrologia Latina* 39 are not included in the database.<sup>77</sup> The absence of these sermons is limiting for scholars interested in authenticity critique. They have to take recourse to the *Patrologia Latina Database*, of which the search functions are a lot less flexible (a single spelling variation in a search string will skew the search results completely). A less visible, but very important limitation is that the *LLT* only contains the most recent editions of the sermons when the publisher who

<sup>72</sup> PARTOENS 2010 (note 17).

<sup>73</sup> André WILMART (1928), ‘Un développement inédit dans le sermon CXLII de *s. Augustin*’, *Revue d’ascétisme et de mystique*, 9, p. 282-290.

<sup>74</sup> MORIN 1930, p. 695-705 (note 47).

<sup>75</sup> DOLBEAU 1996, p. 297-303 (note 5).

<sup>76</sup> Gert PARTOENS, Clemens WEIDMANN (2017), ‘La version augmentée du sermon 295 de saint Augustin: critique d’authenticité et conséquences’, in Clementine BERNARD-VALETTE, Jérémie DELMULLE, Camille GERZAGUET, ed., *Nihil veritas erubescit. Mélanges offerts à Paul Mattei par ses élèves, collègues et amis* (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia, 74), Turnhout: Brepols, p. 105-121.

<sup>77</sup> Actually, quite a few of them are included in the *LLT*, because they are in fact sermons by Caesarius of Arles, which were edited in Germain MORIN, ed. (1953), *Sancti Caesarii Arelatensis sermones nunc primum in unum collecti et ad leges artis criticae ex innumeris mss. recogniti* (Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina, 103-104), Turnhout: Brepols.

printed those editions gave permission for them to be reproduced in the database. This limitation is clearly stated in the pdf-file on the *sermones ad populum* and the publishers who have denied their permission are few in number – and of course the *Corpus Christianorum* is published by Brepols themselves – but still it is important to be aware of this. A recent notable absence from the *LLT* is the edition by Clemens Weidmann of a number of sermons (ss. 2A, 59A, 61B, 204B-D, 225auct., 272C, 295auct., 298A, 319B, 363A-B) previously considered inauthentic.<sup>78</sup> Finally, there is of course the fact that, like the *Patrologia Latina Database*, the *Library of Latin Texts* is behind a paywall, though many institutions and libraries offer access to their members.<sup>79</sup>

At this moment, the *Library of Latin Texts* offers the most up-to-date digital text of Augustine's authentic *sermones ad populum*.<sup>80</sup> I sincerely hope the editors of the database will continue their efforts to incorporate new editions as they appear.<sup>81</sup>

*b. The versions of Augustine's sermons: PS-AU s 183 = AU s 272C = [FU] s 8 = PS-FU s 50*

The concordance of the different names or labels of Augustine's sermons offered in Brepols' *Library of Latin Texts* and illustrated in the two examples in the previous section, is a very useful feature for

<sup>78</sup> WEIDMANN 2015 (note 18).

<sup>79</sup> Scholars unable to access either database who find themselves in need of an electronic version of the sermons of Augustine considered either authentic by the Maurists or among their *sermones dubii* can find such a text, in the version of the *Patrologia Latina*, on <http://www.augustinus.it/latino/index.htm> (consulted on 23 April 2019).

<sup>80</sup> An alternative is offered by the Zentrum für Augustinus-Forschung at Würzburg, which publishes the *Corpus Augustinianum Gissense* (<https://www.cag-online.net>, consulted on 30 May 2019). The CAG offers a digital full text of the sermons, using, as the website states, the best available editions, but the most recent new editions it offers, as far as I was able to ascertain, are the first editions of the Erfurt sermons (2009). It has the advantage over the *LLT* in that it offers more text at a single glance. It offers versatile search functions, but it does not have the *LLT*'s similarity search function. The CAG additionally offers a very expansive bibliography on Augustine, which does include recently published new editions of the sermons.

<sup>81</sup> I would like to add a short addendum. Those scholars interested in Augustine's vocabulary in the sermons might find it useful to learn that the *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae*, published by the Gruyter, is now available in an Open Access pdf-version (of all volumes published to date: A-M, O-P). While this pdf obviously does not offer the possibilities of the database, it is still very useful for scholars for whom the paywall is a problem. It is accessible at <http://www.thesaurus.badw.de/en/tll-digital/tll-open-access.html> (consulted on 23 April 2019).

tracking down the different editions of a particular sermon. To return to the example of *s. 142*, the different labels of the sermon, “AU *s 142* = *s Wilmart 11 + s Dolbeau 7* [= *Moguntinus 15*]” each refer to progressive editions of and scholarship on the sermon in question. The labels here invariably refer to the collections in which longer or better versions of the same sermons were discovered (‘*Moguntinus*’) or to the scholars who discovered them (‘*Wilmart*’, ‘*Dolbeau*’).

However, another set of concordances exists, which reflects a far less linear (from edition to edition) progression and a far more complex system of connections between Augustine’s sermons – predominantly among the inauthentic sermons. These connections arise from the fact that sermons as a rule are very unstable objects in the manuscript context. Their titles could change depending on the purpose of the collections they were featured in. Similarly, the author attribution is changeable from manuscript to manuscript. This malleability is likely at least partly caused by the fact that these sermons served a practical purpose in the Medieval context, necessitating adaptations and manipulations of the text to fit a different historical, social, religious context. The texts of patristic sermons were also used throughout Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages as ‘inspiration’ for other sermons. This reuse went from borrowing entire passages word-for-word, to extensive rewriting that left only a hint of the original sermon. This is exactly how a large number of inauthentic Augustinian sermons came to be created.

I already mentioned the hybrid status of the sermons compiled and edited by Caesarius of Arles (cf. *supra* p. 97). In numerous cases, an Augustinian sermon was so heavily edited by the Bishop of Arles that Germain Morin<sup>82</sup> edited it as a Caesarian sermon. However, the pure – or at least purer – Augustinian version can be preserved in other collections. Similarly, original Caesarian sermons can contain large swaths of authentic Augustinian material. This results in sermons which are identified as both Augustinian and Caesarian in the reference works. So, for example, AU *s 167* is linked to CAE *s 181*, AU *s 114* is used as a source in CAE *s 39*, and AU *s 8* has material in common with CAE *s 100*.

In the case of Caesarius of Arles, we can reconstruct the historical circumstances that have led to the connections between Augustine’s and Caesarius’ sermons, but the corpus of patristic sermons – predominantly the corpus of inauthentic patristic sermons – is littered with examples

<sup>82</sup> MORIN 1953 (note 77).

of essentially the same text with several labels attached to it, which basically signifies that the same text is considered part of the sermon corpora of different authors. The title of this section presents an example. In their appendix (the series of sermons they considered wrongly attributed to Augustine), the Maurists listed as Augustine's *sermo app.* 183 a short sermon on Pentecost (*PL*, 39, c. 2091-2092). The same sermon, with some variations in the text, was edited twice as part of the corpus of (pseudo-)Fulgentius: [FU] s 8 (*PL*, 65, c. 742-744) and PS-FU s 50 (*PL*, 65, c. 916-917). In 2015 Clemens Weidmann argued for the sermon's authenticity and reinstated it in Augustine's homiletic corpus as *s. 272C*.<sup>83</sup> So, because several scholars and editors encountered different manifestations of what was essentially the same text and set out to record a particular manifestation or attribution, this single sermon currently has four different labels.<sup>84</sup> The result of this scholarly activity is a tangle of cross-references between pseudo-epigraphic sermons attributed to different patristic authors.

It is hardly surprising that the field of patristic sermon studies has, for the most part, steered clear of this particular hornet's nest. This intricate and only partially recorded web of interdependencies is, perhaps, the most unwieldy part of the legacy left us by the great scholars of the past. So, what gateways do we have to access the pseudo-Augustinian sermons and their manifold manifestations? The instruments currently in place to trace the different versions of a particular sermon are two printed reference works of which we can only speak with the utmost respect and veneration. The first is the *Répertoire général des auteurs ecclésiastiques latins de l'Antiquité et du Haut Moyen Âge*, the collection of sigla used in the apparatuses to the edition of the *Vetus Latina*, started by Bonifatius Fischer, continued by Hermann J. Frede, and most recently, in 2007, updated by Roger Gryson.<sup>85</sup> Easily searchable, this volume essentially follows the Maurist numbering, along with the modern additions (p. 231-268), but, mercifully, does not stop at *sermo 396* (the last of the Maurists' *dubii*), but continues with the pseudo-Augustinian sermons (p. 275-314). The list of pseudo-Augustinian sermons contains numerous cross-references and also several references to the second gateway we have to the pseudo-Augustinian sermons, the *Clavis Patristica Pseudepigraphorum Medii Aevi* or *CPPM*.<sup>86</sup> The structure of

<sup>83</sup> WEIDMANN 2015, p. 121-133 (note 18).

<sup>84</sup> This is just one example. There are several other scenarios and different sets of circumstances that have led to the same text being identified with different labels.

<sup>85</sup> GRYSON 2007 (note 65, with reference to a digital copy of Gryson's list).

<sup>86</sup> MACHIELSEN 1990 (note 50).

the *CPPM*, while essentially straightforward, is a little harder to penetrate because Machielsen introduced a new numbering system, which allows him greater ease for internal cross-referencing. The *CPPM* offers a lot of information on each sermon. As an example, I reproduce below two entries (p. 186-187), for PS-AU s 182 and 183, the latter of which I used as an example earlier as well (cf. p. 107):

**967 (182). In Pentecoste. I.** Inc.: “Post illam singularem insignemque victoriam” – expl.: “illum possemus ascendere, cui est gloria” (PS-MAX s Bruni app. 8 [n. 5940]; PS-LEO n. 5560)

*PL*, 39, 2087-2091; *PL*, 57, 857-860.

**Fontes – Usus:** N. 1: PS-EUS h 9 (n. 4625); n. 3: PS-EUS h 29 (n. 4646), 3 (FREDE, 164)

**Usus:** Nn. 1-2: PS-AU n. 2456 ex Alano II, 29 (J.P. BOUHOT, *Rev. Hist. Text.*, 4, 1974, 210).

**Trad. text.** Alanus (s. VIII), II, 29: anon. (GRÉGOIRE, 172, cum al. hom.)

**968 (183). In Pentecoste. II.** Inc.: “Fratres charissimi, hodierna die anniversaria solemnitas agitur, qua die” – expl.: “divisionis non debet offendere” (PS-FU s 50 [n. 4842], FU s 8 dubius [n. 4876], inc.: “Anniversaria solemnitas agitur”)

*PL*, 39, 2091-2092; *PL*, 65, 742-744; *PL*, 65, 916-917.

**Trad. text.** Agimundus (s. VIII), II, 60, ff. 177v-179v: August. (GRÉGOIRE, 358 cum al. hom.); SS. Cath. Patres (n. 769) (s. XII<sup>med</sup>), n. 230: August.; ms. Raynaud hunc sermonem Augustino attribuit (GRÉGOIRE, 120, n. L; vide et *PL*, 65, 915-916, and. Xx).

Machielsen provides, among others, information on the transmission of the sermons, referring to the homiliaries of Alanus of Farfa and Agimundus, with a bibliographical reference to Grégoire's seminal works on Medieval homiliaries.<sup>87</sup> Very interesting is the fact that Machielsen regularly indicates to which author the sermon is attributed in these collections. Often, he will also mention manuscript witnesses that contain the sermon in question. More importantly still, for our purpose, Machielsen specifies several other sermons that have some connection with the items described here. These sermons can be (mostly) identical with the present item, but only have a different label

<sup>87</sup> GRÉGOIRE 1980 (note 60) and Réginald GRÉGOIRE (1966), *Les homéliaires du Moyen Âge. Inventaire et analyse des manuscrits*, Rome: Herder.

(like PS-FU s 50, FU s 8 *dubius*), but Machielsen also points to sermons that have served as sources for (parts of) the present item or that have used the present item as a source. There are some flaws in the system, however. Linkage can be incomplete: many cross-references are only indicated in one direction, and often an entry will offer a link only to one other entry, while in this second entry, further links to other connected sermons are provided. These inconsistencies are entirely understandable given the scope of the work and the still largely analogue context in which it was created.

Though these reference works are a big help toward untangling the many different versions and manifestations of (pseudo-)Augustinian sermons, their main downside is that they are currently accessible only in print,<sup>88</sup> which makes cross-referencing difficult and time-consuming. If we are ever to truly penetrate the corpus of pseudo-Augustinian sermons, this huge and still too often neglected collection of Late-Antique and Medieval sermons, if we are to properly categorize them and valorize them as sources, we need to take the reference system we inherited from our predecessors to a new level of user-friendly connectivity. We need, therefore, an electronic database that combines the richness of the information offered in the *CPPM* with the clarity of Gryson's lists. Such a database should be capable of accommodating different versions of the same sermon and different author attributions. It should distinguish link types to qualify the connections between sermons (e.g. 'is equal to', 'makes use of', 'has material in common with' etc.). Finally, it should present these linked sermons in a clear, easy-to-grasp visualization. This database is at the moment a *desideratum*, not a reality, but it should, if all goes well, become a reality in the next few years. I am currently directing a five-year ERC-funded project at Radboud University Nijmegen titled 'Patristic sermons in the Middle Ages. The dissemination, manipulation, and interpretation of Late-Antique sermons in the Medieval Latin West (PASSIM)'.<sup>89</sup> This project has, as one of its main aims, the establishment

<sup>88</sup> However, see note 65 for reference to a digital copy of Gryson's list. A project is currently underway to integrate several *Claves* in a digital environment: the *Clavis Clavium*. Initially carried out at KU Leuven under the direction of Gert Partoens, data-input, publication and continued maintenance of the database is now being done by Brepols, the project's commercial partner, but – happily! – in Open Access. Unfortunately, the *CPPM* was not selected to be included in the so-called *Clacla* at this stage. The database can be consulted at <https://clavis.brepols.net/clacla/> (consulted on 24 April 2019).

<sup>89</sup> PASSIM is funded by the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation program, under grant agreement No ERC-2018-stg 802210. The project will run from 2019 to 2023.

of a solid methodological foundation for research into the massive corpus of Late-Antique and Medieval sermons wrongly attributed to Augustine and other patristic preachers. However, a streamlined digital version of the existing reference works currently in place to access and identify (pseudo-)Augustine's sermons is only part of this project's aims. More specifically, it aims to reconstruct the network of Medieval manuscripts that transmit patristic sermons. A clear understanding of which labels cover which versions of Augustine's and other patristic sermons is a necessary first step to realize this purpose.

*c. The manuscripts of Augustine's sermons: the PASSIM project*

Several case studies have already demonstrated that Augustine's sermons, and patristic sermons in general, are highly relevant sources for the study of Medieval intellectual, social, and religious history. They offer a wealth of information on pertinent topics such as – to name a few – the impact of the Early Middle Ages on later centuries,<sup>90</sup> intellectual exchange in the monastic sphere,<sup>91</sup> the Medieval engagement with the authorities of the past,<sup>92</sup> the complexity of the web of Medieval knowledge dissemination.<sup>93</sup> However promising these results are, it must be clear that we have not even begun to plumb the depths of the Medieval reception of Augustine's sermons, at least not in terms of in-depth historical and theological analysis.

<sup>90</sup> See for example R. Emmet McLAUGHLIN (1991), 'The Word Eclipsed? Preaching in the Early Middle Ages', *Traditio*, 46, p. 77-122; Lisa K. BAILEY (2010), *Christianity's Quiet Success. The Eusebius Gallicanus Sermon Collection and the Power of the Church in Late Antique Gaul*, Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press; Zachary GUILIANO, *The composition, dissemination, and use of the homiliary of Paul the Deacon in Carolingian Europe from the late eighth to mid-tenth century* (unpubl. doct. diss.), Cambridge, 2016.

<sup>91</sup> See for example Shari BOODTS (2013), 'A Critical Assessment of Wolfenbüttel Herz.-Aug.-Bibl. Cod. Guelf. 237 (Helmst. 204) and its Value for the Edition of St. Augustine's *Sermones ad populum*', in Markus VINZENT, ed., *Studia Patristica LXIX: Papers presented at the Sixteenth International Conference on Patristic Studies held in Oxford 2011*, vol. 18: *St Augustine and his Opponents*, Leuven: Peeters, p. 465-476.

<sup>92</sup> See for example Stéphane GIOANNI (2013), 'The Constitution and Functions of Collections of Patristic Extracts: The example of the Eucharistic Controversy (9th-11th centuries)', in Lucie DOLEZALOVÁ, Kimberley RIVERS, ed., *Medieval Manuscript Miscellanies: Composition, Authorship, Use*, Krems: Medium Aevum Quotidianum, p. 185-196.

<sup>93</sup> See for example DIESENBERGER et al. 2013 (note 59); François DOLBEAU (2013), 'La transmission des œuvres d'Augustin et l'évolution intellectuelle de l'Occident médiéval (Ve-XVe siècles)', *Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses*, 89/4, p. 229-252.

The task is very daunting. The manuscript transmission of Augustine has to yield only to the Bible and liturgical books in terms of volume and dissemination and Augustine's sermons were among the most widespread of his works in the Middle Ages.<sup>94</sup> A historical or theological analysis of the Medieval afterlife of Augustine's sermons is thus hampered by the enormity of the primary source material. A second hampering factor is the fact that information on the manuscripts is buried in manuscript catalogues and gathered in the introductions and apparatuses of critical editions – not the most obvious of secondary literature, nor the most thrilling of reading material. Editors of patristic sermons do tend to have a solid grasp of the manuscript tradition and the heuristic instruments necessary to explore it, but the goal of the editor is first and foremost to reconstruct the patristic original and the contextualization of the manuscript witnesses is often only summarily executed.

Still, over the course of this philological work, a great deal of research has been done into the manuscript tradition of Augustine's oeuvre. Knowledge of the manuscript transmission of his oeuvre is at an exemplary level, compared to the situation for several other important patristic and classical authors. Unfortunately, the description of Augustine's sermons leaves a lot to be desired in many manuscript catalogues, due to their changeable nature, the difficulties their identification can present, and the fact that they were long considered of secondary importance. Let us review what tools we have to penetrate the manuscript transmission of Augustine's sermons.

It is an incredible luxury for scholars of Augustine to have at their disposal the *Handschriftliche Überlieferung der Werke des Heiligen Augustinus* (HÜWA), which is up to eleven volumes at the moment. Organized geographically, each volume lists, in a first part, all the works of Augustine accompanied by lists of manuscripts transmitting them, and in a second part, lists of manuscripts with descriptions of their content arranged alphabetically by city and library. The sermons are a difficult category. Obviously, the volumes' *Werkverzeichnis* does not list each of the Maurists' 396 authentic *sermones ad populum* individually and the amount of detail varies greatly. Some volumes mention certain collections or homiliaries as a separate category, most include pseudo-Augustinian sermons in the content descriptions. A good rule of thumb is that the more recent volumes tend to provide more detailed identifications for the sermons. Secondly, of course, the *Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina* editions are

<sup>94</sup> DOLBEAU 2013 (note 93).

an obvious place to find information on the sermon manuscripts in context. Again, the more recent editions contain significantly more information on the manuscript tradition than the first instalment of the series in 1961 (*CCSL*, 41). The most recent general *status quaestionis* regarding the transmission of the sermons is recorded in the 2008 volume by Luc De Coninck and his collaborators (*CCSL*, 41Aa), with detailed updates in the subsequent volumes (*CCSL*, 41Ab and Bb). Several databases can be put to good use for the recovery of manuscripts containing (pseudo-)Augustinian sermons, such as *Mirabile*,<sup>95</sup> *In Principio: Index of Latin Texts*,<sup>96</sup> and the *IRHT*'s *Bibliothèque Virtuelle des Manuscrits Médiévaux*.<sup>97</sup>

Patristic sermon studies benefit greatly from the increasing online availability of manuscript catalogues. A non-negligible portion of Augustinian sermon manuscripts is covered in some of the major digital catalogues like *Gallica*<sup>98</sup> and *archives et manuscrits*<sup>99</sup> for the *Bibliothèque Nationale de France* (especially important because of the lack of a *HÜWA*-volume for France at the moment), *e-codices*<sup>100</sup> for the manuscript libraries of Switzerland, and in the digital collections of the *Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana*<sup>101</sup> and the *Bayerische Staatsbibliothek*,<sup>102</sup> to name but a few. Of greater value still is the growing availability of digitized images of the manuscript originals. Such easy and qualitative access to the primary sources yields immediate results.<sup>103</sup> Still, even in the digital age printed catalogues should not be dismissed. Only recently the final volume, containing the *indices*, of Bernhard Bischoff's *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts* appeared.<sup>104</sup>

These instruments are geared first and foremost toward philological work and stemmatological and paleographical research. Their relative isolation and highly individualized structures complicate their

<sup>95</sup> <http://www.mirabileweb.it> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>96</sup> Accessible via Brepolis' database app: <http://apps.brepolis.net/BrepolisPortal/default.aspx> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>97</sup> <https://bvmm.irht.cnrs.fr/> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>98</sup> <https://gallica.bnf.fr/> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>99</sup> <https://archivesetmanuscrits.bnf.fr/> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>100</sup> <https://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>101</sup> <https://digi.vatlib.it/> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>102</sup> <https://www.digitale-sammlungen.de/> (consulted on 26 April 2019).

<sup>103</sup> See e.g. Jérémie DELMULLE, Warren PEZÉ (2016), 'Un manuscrit de travail d'Eugippe: le ms. Città del Vaticano, BAV, Pal. lat. 210', *Sacris Erudiri*, 55, p. 195-258.

<sup>104</sup> Birgit EBERSPERGER, Bernhard BISCHOFF (2017), *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen). Gesamtregister*, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag. For a review by David Ganz, see <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/frrec/article/view/60186/52866> (consulted on 24 April 2019).

application in contextual historical and theological research. The recently started PASSIM project<sup>105</sup> wants to facilitate wider and more varied uses for the data contained in these instruments and add a significant amount of new data on manuscripts of patristic sermons, all integrated in a user-friendly database.

The PASSIM database will contain descriptions of Medieval manuscripts that contain collections of patristic sermons<sup>106</sup> and create a flexible environment to filter searches and visualize the results. It will allow users (1) to search for a sermon or combination of sermons and find all the manuscripts that transmit it/them, (2) to view the composition of a manuscript or combination of manuscripts, (3) to visualize the transmission trajectory of a particular sermon or sermon collection.<sup>107</sup> For every sermon the database will contain: *incipit(s)*, *explicit(s)*, attributed author(s), numbering(s) in different reference works, keywords, manuscript witnesses, identification of the feast or period it is connected to in a liturgical context, whether it is part of pre-defined standard collections, indications of the existence of different versions of the sermon, editions and links to online full text. For every manuscript the database will contain: a detailed analysis of its content, structural features (e.g. *capitula*), date and place of origin (if known), provenance, bibliography, and links to digitized images (if applicable). Aside from traditional list views, the database will be able to generate for each query a flexible, extensible network of nodes and ties, with the proximity between the nodes reflecting the level of similarity between the composition of the manuscripts containing the particular sermon or collection that was the subject of the query. These visualizations will allow the user to get a big picture-view of the transmission of patristic sermons in the Middle Ages.

The purpose of the PASSIM database is to give an accurate impression, on an expansive scale, of the mobility of patristic sermons and the manuscripts that carried them, of the enormous system that governed knowledge exchange in the Middle Ages. However, it is clear that it is not possible to input thousands of sermons in thousands of manuscripts over a period of five years (which is the duration of

<sup>105</sup> <https://applejack.science.ru.nl/passimproject/> (consulted on 27 May 2019).

<sup>106</sup> Relevant in the context of this project are all texts that are part of Late-Antique and Medieval compilations of which the main content consists of sermons attributed to patristic authors. The project will not consider sermons that are transmitted in isolation, i.e. manuscripts that contain just one sermon or a few sermons interspersed with other works that have no relation to the tradition of preaching.

<sup>107</sup> This can be a collection recognized in one of the existing reference works, but equally a random series of sermons put together by the user based on the subject of his or her research.

the PASSIM project). During the runtime of the project, the database will be used to tackle a number of representative cases and important questions regarding Augustine's sermons, and Latin patristic sermons more widely, in the Middle Ages. The project team will prioritize several key-threads in the network to serve as a methodological foundation, as a way to test the database and solve the thorny issues associated with the imperfect and complex source materials that deliver the data. This fundamental work will help us to get a sense of the possibilities offered by this type of digital environment for research into the Medieval reception of Augustine's sermons.<sup>108</sup>

#### 4. Conclusion

In his conclusion<sup>109</sup> to the volume *Preaching in the Patristic Era*, Adam Ployd offers three desiderata for the way forward for the field of patristic sermon studies. Ployd urges historical theologians to go beyond the classical canon of doctrinal treatises and harness the wealth of the sermons to introduce comparative perspectives:

“[...] a scholar tracing the development of the doctrine of the Trinity can learn much from Augustine's *De Trinitate*, but not as much as one could from placing that oft-debated text in conversation with the myriad sermons in which he teaches the doctrine to his congregation.”<sup>110</sup>

Secondly, Ployd points to the rewards that can be reaped if we explore a greater variety of methodologies to approach the sermons, if we deepen and expand our contextual and rhetorical analyses of early Latin sermons and make greater use of more recent literary and critical theory. Thirdly, Ployd pleads for increased efforts at collaboration. He singles out the divide between 'scholars who bring explicitly theological concerns to the material and those who are more shaped by social and cultural methods of history.'<sup>111</sup>

<sup>108</sup> If all goes according to plan, a pilot version of the database will become available in 2020. This version will include an update platform allowing external users to propose changes and complete information in the database. Even before this pilot version becomes accessible, I welcome all suggestions and questions regarding the PASSIM project, as the project team is committed to making the tool useful for as many scholars as possible.

<sup>109</sup> Adam PLOYD (2018), 'Attending to the Word: A Concluding Look at Latin Patristic Preaching and a Vision for the Way Forward', in Anthony DUPONT, Shari BOODTS, Gert PARTOENS, Johan LEEMANS, ed., *Preaching in the Patristic Era. Sermons, Preachers, and Audiences in the Latin West* (A New History of the Sermon, 6), Leiden-Boston: Brill, p. 479-497.

<sup>110</sup> PLOYD 2018, p. 492 (note 109).

<sup>111</sup> PLOYD 2018, p. 494 (note 109).

While I would not contest the reality of this gap, I believe another gap needs to be bridged first, and that is the gap between textual criticism, philology, and manuscript studies on the one hand and historical and theological studies on the other hand. The ways forward enumerated by Ployd can only happen effectively if historians and theologians have a full, accurate, and nuanced grasp of the primary source materials that lie at the heart of their investigations. Therefore, philologists and editors must make their research results easy to access and interpret if we are all to put our hard-won knowledge to its best use and if we are to harness the full potential of the enormous data stream we have access to today.

Even if we are successful in this, we are not yet done bridging gaps. The fields of patristic and Medieval sermon studies would also benefit hugely from a closer collaboration. The instant of composing or delivering a sermon amounts to only a fraction of its life. From the moment a sermon starts to circulate, it is appropriated as part of new liturgical, exegetical, polemical, or scholarly contexts. The perception of Augustine as an all-powerful authority, his popular image and reputation, his association with a defined set of beliefs that was transmitted to and impacted modern times – all this took shape during the Middle Ages, through the recycling, reorganizing and reinterpreting of his oeuvre. Sermons reveal this process as it was happening, because of their textual and paratextual instability, their varied uses and wide dissemination, and the ease of misattributing them. To look at the Medieval transmission of patristic sermons is to see the Medieval image of Augustine and the Church Fathers take shape. This Medieval image is intricately tied to the massive pseudo-Augustinian sermon corpus, which is long overdue an in-depth, unbiased investigation.

At this point there are many paths that Augustinian sermon studies can follow. It is my fervent hope that scholars in the field will put the existing instruments, both old and new, to good use, and strive to forge and strengthen interdisciplinary collaborations to the benefit of all. From the consolidation of existing interests to imaginative new avenues for research, I have no doubt that the field of Augustinian sermon studies has rich and rewarding results still in store for us.

Shari Boodts  
Radbout Universiteit Nijmegen  
Department of History, Art History and Classics  
Institute for Historical, Literary and Cultural Studies